



HISTORIC LANDMARKS COMMISSION

DISCUSSION NOTES

July 11, 2018

Special Meeting

6:30 p.m.

Tower Room, T-332

Third Floor, City Hall Tower

200 East Santa Clara Street

San José, CA 95113

Commission Members

Edward Saum, Chair

Vacant, Vice Chair

Harriett Arnold

Paul Boehm

Melissa Daniels

Anthony Raynsford

Stephen Polcyn

Rosalynn Hughey, Director

Department of Planning, Building & Code Enforcement

Note

To request an accommodation for City-sponsored meetings or events or an alternative format for printed materials, please call Support Staff at 408-535-7721 or 408-294-9337 (TTY) as soon as possible, but at least three business days before any meeting or event. If you requested such an accommodation, please identify yourself to the technician seated at the staff table. If you did not call in advance and do now need assistance, please see the technician.

NOTICE TO THE PUBLIC

If you want to address the Commission, **fill out a speaker card (located at the technician's station), and give the completed card to the technician. Please include the agenda item number for reference.**

The procedure for public hearings is as follows:

- After the staff report, *applicants may make a five-minute presentation.*
- Anyone wishing to speak in favor of the proposal should prepare to come forward. After the proponents speak, anyone wishing to speak in opposition should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have two minutes.*
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- The Commission will then close the public hearing.
- *The Historic Landmarks Commission will take action on the item.*

The procedure for referrals is as follows:

- Anyone wishing to speak on a referral should prepare to come forward. *Each speaker will have two minutes.*
- Commissioners may ask questions of the speakers. These questions will not reduce the speaker's time allowance.
- *The Historic Landmarks Commission will comment on the referral item.*

If a Commissioner would like a topic to be addressed under one of the Good and Welfare items, please contact Planning staff in advance of the Commission meeting.

An agenda and a copy of all staff reports have been placed on the table for your convenience. All public records relating to an open session item on this agenda, which are not exempt from disclosure pursuant to the California Public Records Act, that are distributed to a majority of the legislative body will be available for public inspection at the Planning, Building and Code Enforcement at San José City Hall, 200 E. Santa Clara Street, 3rd Floor Tower, San José, CA 95113 at the same time that the public records are distributed or made available to the legislative body.

AGENDA

ORDER OF BUSINESS

ROLL CALL

PRESENT: Commissioners Saum, Polcyn, Boehm
ABSENT: Commissioners Arnold, Daniels, Raynsford
VACANT: One Seat

NO QUORUM

DUE TO LACK OF QUORUM, CHAIR SAUM PROCEEDED WITH MEETING AS A DISCUSSION FOR ITEM 3.A. NO VOTING OR RECOMMENDATION TOOK PLACE. ALL ITEMS CONTINUED TO 8/1 REGULAR MEETING AGENDA.

1. DEFERRALS

Any item scheduled for hearing this evening for which deferral is being requested will be taken out of order to be heard first on the matter of deferral. If you want to change any of the deferral dates recommended or speak to the question of deferring these or any other items, you should say so at this time.

No Items

2. CONSENT CALENDAR

The consent calendar items are considered to be routine and will be adopted by one motion. There will be no separate discussion of these items unless a request is made by a member of the Historic Landmarks Commission, staff or the public to have an item removed from the consent calendar and considered separately. If anyone in the audience wishes to speak on one of these items, please make your request at this time.

No Items

3. PUBLIC HEARINGS

- a. **H17-062 and HP18-002.** Site Development Permit and Historic Preservation Permit to allow the demolition of non-historic patios and stairways and construction of a new commercial building on the corner of North Almaden Street and West Santa Clara Street immediately adjacent and attached to the Lyndon Building, a designated City Landmark. The new construction would consist of 3,459 sf of ground floor commercial/restaurant space and 1,920 sf of second floor office space. The project site at 169 W Santa Clara Street is .11 acres.

Recommendation: Review and provide recommendations for information to be included in the historic report and project analysis.

Cassandra Van Der Zweep presented the staff report.

The project applicant team described project details and design direction as summarized:

- *Site is currently a patio used by nearby restaurants for decades, since the 1980s*
- *Property is in long term family ownership*
- *Applicant designed a one-story to not compete with the two-story adjacent Lyndon Building*
- *New building is a separate addition to the historic Lyndon Building*
- *Project is on same parcel as parcel as Lyndon Building and provides access to upper floor*
- *Entrance to new building would be at the corner*
- *Style is modern with glass and wood treatments along exterior*
- *Second floor of new building will be open to the area below*
- *Design is intended to not obscure the visual frame of the other historic buildings*
- *Use is intended to be retail and restaurant*
- *Applicant team's approach is to keep the integrity of this block*
- *This block has history of architecture, use, and architects throughout different periods*
- *Design direction was for consistency with past while pointing to future*
- *The project is intended to finish this block and have a good exchange with surrounding uses*
- *The applicant team commissioned a fully historic report with the City*

The Commissioners discussed the project and provided feedback to the applicant team as summarized:

- *Commissioner asked why the corner is at an angle and applicant team explained that the City cut this corner at an angle in the 1980s, consistent with some others in the City*
- *Farmers Union Building has a hard edge, other buildings are rectilinear*
- *Commissioner liked that the building is open to public*
- *Commissioner noted the difference between the geometry of the new and old*
- *Commissioners asked about the use of the wood, "Epay" materials, applicant responded that materials should be modern and not copy with rest of historic buildings and as such they departed from use of plaster materials*
- *Applicant indicated that wood was intended to work with glass and steel and provide a warmer feeling*
- *Commissioner noted that the looks are so different*
- *Commissioners discussed windows and doors*
- *Commissioner asked why materials are so different than existing on block, and that materials should blend and that attention is drawn away from corner*
- *Applicant mentioned the standards used for designing in historic areas, not to copy or mimic the old, and that to be sensitive to that and not to obscure Lyndon Building, to let the over buildings have strength*
- *Applicant's design for one-story was to not draw attention*
- *Commissioner mentioned how they look to the Secretary of the Interior's Standards*
- *Commissioners discussed concerns with materials, and colors, specifically the Epay materials and its coloration*
- *Applicant and Commissioners discussed possibility of restoring the Lyndon storefront*
- *Applicant mentioned that they tried not to look iconic, and applied the indoor/outdoor focus*
- *Commissioner mentioned a concern with a two -story option and a setback option*
- *Commissioners discussed how materials and colors relate*
- *Commissioners has various opinions on plaster versus non-plaster materials*

- *Commissioners asked that the historic report look at the historic nature of the block, designing for harmony, one-story versus two-story, what was there before, the “boookends”, the historic uses, the views from various downtown locations*
- *Commissioners debated the public view of the modern design versus the historic character, and the need to mix the old with the new, and that the new should not dominate*
- *Commissioner stated modern is not a problem, new should have an appeal*
- *Commissioners asked that material sample boards be provided at next meeting*
- *Commissioners discussed the “tension” between the buildings and the concerns about the new not “overpowering” the old*
- *Public comment: appreciate that design is sensitive to environment, and appreciate the one-story*

4. REFERRALS FROM CITY COUNCIL, BOARDS, COMMISSIONS, OR OTHER AGENCIES

No Items

5. OPEN FORUM

Members of the public are invited to speak on any item that does not appear on today's Agenda and that is within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Commission. The Commission cannot engage in any substantive discussion or take any formal action in response to the public comment. The Commission can only ask questions or respond to statements to the extent necessary to determine whether to: (1) refer the matter to staff for follow-up; (2) request staff to report back on a matter at a subsequent meeting; or (3) direct staff to place the item on a future agenda. Each member of the public may fill out a speaker's card and has up to two minutes to address the Commission.

The public mentioned concerns over the proposed Greater Garner conservation areas.

6. GOOD AND WELFARE

a. Report from Secretary, Planning Commission, and City Council

1. Past Agenda Items: No items.
2. Future Potential Agenda Items: Park View Towers (HP14-002 & HA14-009-02), Saint James Park (PP16-037/008), and Hotel Clariana (HP17-007).
3. Summary of communications received by the Historic Landmarks Commission.
4. Discussion of Historic Landmarks Commission Retreat.
5. Update on Historic Resources Survey Strategy.

b. Report from Committees

Design Review Subcommittee: Meets the 3rd Wednesday of the month as necessary. Chair Ed Saum to provide brief review of project proposals.

May 16, 2018 – Park View Towers (Early Referral). DRC provided comments on how the new high rise and low-rise project at 39 East Saint James Street can fit in better with the Saint James Square Historic District.

June 20, 2018 – Almaden Corner Hotel Proposal (PRE 18-076, 270 W Santa Clara St). DRC provided comments to address compatibility with the adjacent De Anza Hotel, a property on the National Register of Historic Places.

c. **Approval of Action Minutes**

Recommendation: None

d. **Status of Circulating Environmental Documents**

No environmental documents are currently circulating for public review at this time.

ADJOURNMENT

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ CODE OF CONDUCT FOR PUBLIC MEETINGS IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND COMMITTEE ROOMS

The Code of Conduct is intended to promote open meetings that welcome debate of public policy issues being discussed by the City Council, Redevelopment Agency Board, their Committees, and City Boards and Commissions in an atmosphere of fairness, courtesy, and respect for differing points of view.

1. Public Meeting Decorum:

- a) Persons in the audience will refrain from behavior which will disrupt the public meeting. This will include making loud noises, clapping, shouting, booing, hissing or engaging in any other activity in a manner that disturbs, disrupts or impedes the orderly conduct of the meeting.
- b) Persons in the audience will refrain from creating, provoking or participating in any type of disturbance involving unwelcome physical contact.
- c) Persons in the audience will refrain from using cellular phones and/or pagers while the meeting is in session.
- d) Appropriate attire, including shoes and shirts are required in the Council Chambers and Committee Rooms at all times.
- e) Persons in the audience will not place their feet on the seats in front of them.
- f) No food, drink (other than bottled water with a cap), or chewing gum will be allowed in the Council Chambers and Committee Rooms, except as otherwise pre-approved by City staff.
- g) All persons entering the Council Chambers and Committee Rooms, including their bags, purses, briefcases and similar belongings, may be subject to search for weapons and other dangerous materials.

2. Signs, Objects or Symbolic Material:

- a) Objects and symbolic materials, such as signs or banners, will be allowed in the Council Chambers and Committee Rooms, with the following restrictions:
 - No objects will be larger than 2 feet by 3 feet.
 - No sticks, posts, poles or other such items will be attached to the signs or other symbolic materials.
 - The items cannot create a building maintenance problem or a fire or safety hazard.
- b) Persons with objects and symbolic materials such as signs must remain seated when displaying them and must not raise the items above shoulder level, obstruct the view or passage of other attendees, or otherwise disturb the business of the meeting.
- c) Objects that are deemed a threat to persons at the meeting or the facility infrastructure are not allowed. City staff is authorized to remove items and/or individuals from the Council Chambers and Committee Rooms if a threat exists or is perceived to exist. Prohibited items include, but are not limited to: firearms (including replicas and antiques), toy guns, explosive material, and ammunition; knives and other edged weapons; illegal drugs and drug paraphernalia; laser pointers, scissors, razors, scalpels, box cutting knives, and other cutting tools; letter openers, corkscrews, can openers with points, knitting needles, and hooks; hairspray, pepper spray, and aerosol containers; tools; glass containers; and large backpacks and suitcases that contain items unrelated to the meeting.

CITY OF SAN JOSÉ CODE OF CONDUCT FOR PUBLIC MEETINGS IN THE COUNCIL CHAMBERS AND COMMITTEE ROOMS (CONT'D)

3. Addressing the Council, Redevelopment Agency Board, Committee, Board or Commission:
- a) Persons wishing to speak on an agenda item or during open forum are requested to complete a speaker card and submit the card to the City Clerk or other administrative staff at the meeting.
 - b) Meeting attendees are usually given two (2) minutes to speak on any agenda item and/or during open forum; the time limit is in the discretion of the Chair of the meeting and may be limited when appropriate. Applicants and appellants in land use matters are usually given more time to speak.
 - c) Speakers should discuss topics related to City business on the agenda, unless they are speaking during open forum.
 - d) Speakers' comments should be addressed to the full body. Requests to engage the Mayor, Council Members, Board Members, Commissioners or Staff in conversation will not be honored. Abusive language is inappropriate.
 - e) Speakers will not bring to the podium any items other than a prepared written statement, writing materials, or objects that have been inspected by security staff.
 - f) If an individual wishes to submit written information, he or she may give it to the City Clerk or other administrative staff at the meeting.
 - g) Speakers and any other members of the public will not approach the dais at any time without prior consent from the Chair of the meeting.

Failure to comply with this Code of Conduct which will disturb, disrupt or impede the orderly conduct of the meeting may result in removal from the meeting and/or possible arrest.